

Full Length Research

ASSESSMENT OF BACTERIOLOGICAL QUALITY OF BREAD SOLD IN KANO METROPOLIS, NIGERIA

***¹ABUBAKAR A. I., ²ISHAQ S. A., ²RABIU H.D., ¹NAFIU S. N., ³ABDULAZIZ U. A., ⁴HARUNA M.**

¹Department of Science Laboratory Technology, Kano State Polytechnic, Nigeria.

²Department of Biology, Federal College of Education (Technical) Bichi, Kano State, Nigeria.

³National Institute of Hospitality and Tourism, Lagos State, Nigeria.

³Department of Microbiology, Bauchi State University Gadau, Bauchi State, Nigeria.

⁴Department of Biological Sciences, Al-kalam University Katsina, Katsina State.

ABSTRACT

Received 11 Aug, 2017

Revised on the 17 Aug, 2017

Accepted 30 Oct, 2017

*Corresponding Author's Email:
aabubakarishak@gmail.com

Bread is an important staple food that does not require further processing before consumption. A total of 150 locally produced bread samples were randomly collected from three local government areas within Kano State metropolis (Dala, Gwale and Kumbotso). The samples were analysed for bacteriological analysis using standard methods. Samples analysed from Dala, Gwale and Kumbotso local government areas were found to contain total aerobic bacteria counts (mean±SD) ranged from $6.43 \pm 0.72 \times 10^2$ to $44.83 \pm 1.30 \times 10^2$, $8.78 \pm 0.18 \times 10^2$ to $35.95 \pm 1.04.28 \times 10^2$ and $20.62 \pm 0.23 \times 10^2$ to $48.27 \pm 0.34 \times 10^2$, respectively. Various bacterial species were identified and their frequency occurrence include; *E. coli* (18.01%), *S. aureus* (45.00%), *Bacillus sp.* (1.90%), *Enterobacter sp.* (27.92%), *Klebsiella sp.* (1.08%), *Proteus sp.* (4.05%) and *Salmonella sp.* (2.04%). The results reveal that the counts were above the permissible limits recommended by World Health Organization (WHO) and International Commission on Microbiological Specification of Food (ICMFS) in foods. The high bacterial counts of most of the samples can be attributed to the poor hygienic practices which may pose biohazards to consumers. This suggests that related agency should continue surveillance and enforcement of use of Good manufacturing practise in bakeries.

Keywords: Bacteriological analysis; Bread; Bakeries; Bacterial species

INTRODUCTION

One of the readily available foods is bread, which is a staple food that does not require further processing before consumption (Olusegun *et al.*, 2015). It is produced in various forms and eaten in homes, restaurant and hotels throughout Nigeria (Emeje *et al.*, 2010). There are several routes through which bread could be contaminated in the processing chain, especially during packaging at the factory and by vendors, Health Promoting Agency (HPA, 2009). Bread contamination and growth of pathogens alter its

quality and a potential source of infection to consumers since improper handling and poor personal hygiene is implicated in most food-borne illnesses (Ehaval, 2009). When food handlers do not practice safe personal hygiene, they become vehicle for transmission of pathogens, through hands, mouth and skin (HPA, 2009). Seiler, 1988; Weiser *et al.*, 1971, reported that the surface of a fresh baked loaf of bread should be practically free of viable microorganisms, but usually become contaminated by bacteria during cooling and

before wrapping. Food-borne diseases are reported to be widespread in the contemporary world and responsible for about one third of death worldwide (WHO, 2002). Also, widespread occurrence of *Staphylococcus aureus* as food poisoning had been said to result from close association of animal to humans within food preparation area (WHO, 2002). Some bacteria that are important from public health point of view may multiply to dangerously high levels in food without changing their appearance, odour and taste (Nwabueze and Archibald, 1997). The study was aimed to assess the bacteriological quality of bread sold in Kano metropolis, Nigeria.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Materials

All the microbiological Medias and reagents used were of analytical grades and purchased from Ado Jones Scientific Supply and General Enterprises, Kano State. Equipments and Glass Wares used were from the Department of Science Laboratory Technology, Kano State Polytechnic and the Department of Microbiology, Bayero University Kano.

Sample collection

Ten Bread samples were randomly collected from different retail outlets and bakeries in three out of the nine local government areas Kano State metropolis. Representative samples were collected from Dala, Gwale and Kumbotso on monthly basis. The samples analyzed were the mostly consumed at the respective locations. The bread samples were aseptically collected in polyethylene-bag, labelled and then transported to laboratory in an iced box maintained at 4°C until analysis (Unachukwu and Nwakanma, 2015; Isong et al., 2013)

Bacteriological analysis

Enumeration of bacteria was done according to (Anibijuwon and Sunday, 2012) with some modifications using pour plate method. Ten-fold serial dilution of the sample was prepared as follows; one gram (1 g) of each homogenate bread sample was weighed aseptically and dispensed into 9 mL of sterile distilled water to make 10^{-1} dilution. From this mixture, with the use of sterile pipettes, 1 mL was taken from 10^{-1} mixture into 9 mL distilled water in a test-tube to make 10^{-2} dilution rate. Further dilution was made up to 10^{-5} . One millilitre (1 mL) each was taken from the dilution using sterile pipettes and dispensed into

sterile Petri dishes labels with the sample code and dilution factor used. Cooled molten nutrient agar (NA) was poured aseptically and rocked to bring even distribution of the samples, the plates were allowed to set undisturbed. The nutrient agar plates were incubated at 37°C for 24 hrs and examined for microbial growth; number of colonies on each plate were counted and expressed as cfu/g (colony forming units/gram).

Identification of isolates

Pure cultures were obtained by transferring a representative colony to a sterile solid nutrient agar surface and streaked using sterile inoculation loop. The plates were incubated at 37°C for 24 hours, the colonies were streaked on to Eosine methylene blue (EMB) agar, MacConkey agar (MCA), Manitol Egg Yolk Polymyxin (MYP) agar, Mannitol Salt Agar (MSA) and *Salmonella shigella* agar (SSA). The organisms identified were subjected to Gram stained and biochemical tests as: IMVIC tests (indole test, methyl red test, Voges-Proskauer test and citrate test.), carbohydrate utilization, triple sugar iron (TSI) agar, coagulase, motility, catalase, oxidase, citrate utilization and urease production.

Statistical Analysis

Data obtained were subjected to statistical analysis using analysis of variance (ANOVA) with SPSS version 16.0 to determine the significant difference at $p=0.05$.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The results (Table 1) indicates the bacterial counts in cfu/g (mean±SD) for breads sold in Dala local government, the replicates X_1 - X_5 were $44.83 \pm 14.65 \times 10^2$, $22.48 \pm 13.49 \times 10^2$, $1019.51 \pm 892.68 \times 10^2$, $29.79 \pm 15.06 \times 10^2$ and $6.43 \pm 0.72 \times 10^2$ respectively. However the bacterial counts (mean±SD) of X_5 , X_2 and X_4 were significantly lower ($p < 0.05$), where that of X_1 , and X_3 were higher ($p > 0.05$). No significant difference ($p > 0.05$) was found between X_2 and X_4 , respectively. The Bacterial Counts in cfu/g for breads sold in Gwale local government were expressed in (mean±SD) of Y_1 - Y_5 were, $25.60 \pm 12.59 \times 10^2$, $35.95 \pm 17.28 \times 10^2$, $34.21 \pm 16.83 \times 10^2$, $33.14 \pm 17.33 \times 10^2$ and $8.78 \pm 1.18 \times 10^2$ cfu/g, respectively. However the bacterial counts (Mean±SD) of Y_5 , Y_4 , and Y_1 were significantly lower ($p < 0.05$), where as that of Y_3 and Y_2 were higher ($p > 0.05$). No significant difference ($p > 0.05$) was found between Y_1 , Y_2 , Y_3 and Y_4 Statistically. The Bacterial

count in cfu/g of some breads sold in Kumbotso local government were expressed in (mean \pm SD) of Z₁- Z₅ were, 48.27 \pm 20.34 $\times 10^2$, 34.34 \pm 16.56 $\times 10^2$, 35.70 \pm 17.00 $\times 10^2$, 20.62 \pm 12.74 $\times 10^2$ and 35.85 \pm 17.40 $\times 10^2$, respectively. However the bacterial counts (mean \pm SD) of Z₄ and Z₂ were significantly lower (p<0.05), where that of Z₃, Z₅, and Z₁ were higher (p>0.05) respectively. No significant difference (p>0.05) was found between Z₂, Z₃, Z₄ and Z₅ and the local governments under study statistically. The bacterial isolates that occur in this study were: *E. coli*, *S. aureus*, *Enterobacter* sp., *Klebsiella* sp., *Proteus* sp., *Bacillus* sp. and *salmonella* sp.

Table 1: Mean Total Aerobic Bacteria Counts of Some Selected breads sold in Kano Metropolis.

ZONES	TABPC(cfu/g)
DALA	
X ₁	44.83 \pm 1.30 $\times 10^2$
X ₂	22.48 \pm 0.49 $\times 10^2$
X ₃	10.19 \pm 0.24 $\times 10^2$
X ₄	29.79 \pm 0.60 $\times 10^2$
X ₅	6.43 \pm 0.72 $\times 10^2$
GWALE	
Y ₁	25.60 \pm 0.51 $\times 10^2$
Y ₂	35.95 \pm 0.44 $\times 10^2$
Y ₃	34.21 \pm 0.41 $\times 10^2$
Y ₄	33.14 \pm 0.32 $\times 10^2$
Y ₅	8.78 \pm 0.18 $\times 10^2$
KUMBOTSO	
Z ₁	48.27 \pm 0.34 $\times 10^2$
Z ₂	34.34 \pm 0.24 $\times 10^2$
Z ₃	35.70 \pm 0.19 $\times 10^2$
Z ₄	20.62 \pm 0.23 $\times 10^2$
Z ₅	35.85 \pm 0.40 $\times 10^2$

Key: TABPC = Total Aerobic Bacteria Plate Count; cfu/g = Colony Forming Unit/gram; X, Y and Z are replicates of the samples.

Table 2 Frequency Occurrence of Bacteria in the Study for the Three Local Governments

S/N	ORGANISMS ISOLATED	FREQUENCY (%)
1	<i>Bacillus</i> sp.	1.90
2	<i>Entrobacter</i> sp.	27.92
3	<i>Esterichia coli</i>	18.01
4	<i>Klebsiella</i> sp.	1.08
5	<i>Proteus</i> sp.	4.05
6	<i>Staphylococcus aureus</i>	45.00
7	<i>Salmonella</i> sp.	2.04
	TOTAL	100%

The International Commission for Microbiological Specification for Foods (ICMSF, 1996; ICMSF, 1998) state that ready-to-eat foods with plate counts between 0 to 10³ is acceptable, between 10⁴ to $\leq 10^5$ is tolerable and 10⁶ and above is unacceptable. It was observed that almost all the bread samples examined had bacterial

load above the acceptable limit and are therefore microbiologically unacceptable. The bacterial species identified in this study were those common to bread (Ogundare and Adetuyi, 2003). The presence of *B. cereus*, *S. aureus*, *E. coli*, *Klebsiella* sp. and *Proteus* sp. in bread samples used in this study, corroborates with the findings of (Nichols *et al.*, 1999; Mensah *et al.*, 2002; Idowu, 2006; Taulo *et al.*, 2008) in which these organisms were implicated in ready-to-eat-foods. Therefore, presence of *E. coli*, *S. aureus* and *B. cereus* demonstrates a potential health risk as these organisms are pathogenic and have been implicated in food borne diseases (Granum, 2005; Wagner, 2009; CFIA, 2009). *S. aureus*, *E. coli*, *Bacillus* sp. *Klebsiella* sp. and *Salmonella* sp. in relatively high rates could be a matter of serious concern, since these organisms are involved in health complications (Gyar *et al.*, 2014). the occurrence of *Bacillus* sp. in the foods could be due to the fact that it is a spore former. These heat resistant spores may have survived processing while vegetative cells were eliminated. Contamination of foods can result from inappropriate processing, incomplete heating, or secondary contamination through contact with contaminated equipment and utensils (Oranusi *et al.*, 2013). the presence of *E. coli* and *Enterobacter* is an indication of possible faecal contamination of food by workers and poor hygiene practices during food processing (Little *et al.*, 1998; Tambekar *et al.*, 2007). The presence of *S. aureus* is largely as a result of human contact and this suggests poor hygiene practices of the operators since this organism is a normal flora of the skin and nasal passage (Garret, 1988; Nichols *et al.*, 1999), and the high occurrence of *S. aureus* is of serious public health importance because of its ability to cause a wide range of infections especially food-borne intoxication. This was equally reported by Aboh and Oladosu, 2014). *Salmonella* sp. an enteric bacteria is the causative agent of typhoid fever. The increased frequency of food-borne *Salmonella* sp. has been causing recurring outbreaks, sometime with fatal infections which has been linked to the unsanitary practices of food and beverages processes leading to contamination of foods by *Salmonella* sp. The detection of *Salmonella* in the environment including in foods and beverages is a necessary component of public health program (Gyar *et al.*, 2014). The presence of *Klebsiella* sp. as recorded in this study is usually associated with faecal contamination. Being an enteric bacterium its presence indicates poor practices among handlers. Due to the significance of the faecal-oral route transmission for many bacterial food-borne diseases, basic hygiene measures assume a decisive importance in food safety management (Uzeh *et al.*,

2006). Vendors have been reported to introduce contaminant and pathogens that survive and multiply in sufficient numbers to cause illness in the consumer (WHO, 1989; Greig *et al.*, 2007; Todd *et al.*, 2007a,b).

CONCLUSION

This study reveals that there were contaminants in bread sold in Kano, which may pose serious biohazard to consumers. Since, bread is a highly nutritional food consumed by all groups of peoples ranging from infant to the elderly in Nigeria irrespective of sex or status; its microbiological quality should therefore be enhanced. Microbiological standard of food provides safe, sound and wholesome quality and also protects the health of consumers. Bread being a meal that is usually eaten without further processing makes it a veritable source of food borne illness if improperly handled. Foodborne illness can be prevented by good hygiene practices such as the use of Good Manufacturing Practices (GMP) and Hazard Analysis Critical Control Point (HACCP) application in the chain of food production and processing.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The authors acknowledge Dr. Isa Yunusa of Kano University of Science and Technology Wudil, Kano for the Statistical analysis. Mal. Umar Sani Dorayi and Mal. Idris Bala of Microbiology Department, Bayero University Kano, and Mal. Nura Usman of Science Laboratory Technology Department, Kano State Polytechnic, are acknowledged for their technical assistance during field and laboratory work.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

None declared.

REFERENCES

1. Aboh MI and Oladosu P (2014). Microbiological assessment of *Kunun-zaki* marketed in Abuja municipal area council (AMAC) in federal capital territory (FCT), Nigeria. *Afr J Microbiol Res* 8 (15): 1633-1637.
2. Anibijuwon II and Sunday OJ (2012). Isolation of microorganisms from ready to eat foods collected from two selected restaurants in Tanke Oke-Odo, Ilorin. *Int'l J Appl Biol Res* 4(1&2): 128-138.
3. CFIA [Canadian Food Inspection Agency] (2009). *Salmonella* Food Safety Facts. Preventing foodborne illness.
4. Ehavald H (2009). Food safety risk management in bakeries. Presentation at the 3rd Safoodnet seminar St Olav's Hotel, Tallinn, Estonia; May 4-6.
5. Emeje MO, Ofoefule SI, Nnaji AC, Ofoefule AU and Brown SA (2010). Assessment of bread safety in Nigeria: Quantitative determination of potassium bromate and lead. *Afr J Food Sci* 4(6): 394-397.
6. Garret ES (1988). Microbiological standards, guidelines, specifications and inspection of seafood products. *Food Technol* 42: 90-91.
7. Granum PE (2005). *Bacillus cereus* as a Food-borne Pathogen. In: Microbiology and Molecular Biology. Fratamico, P.M., Bhunia, A.K., and Smith, J.L. (Eds), Great Britain. Caister Academic Press. pp. 409-420.
8. Greig JD, Todd ECD, Bartleson CA and Micheals BS (2007). Outbreaks where food workers have been implicated in the spread of foodborne disease. Part 1. Description of the problem, methods and agents involved. *J Food Prot* 70: 1752-1761.
9. Gyar SD, Bala H and Reuben CR (2014). Bacteriological quality assessment of Nigerian Non-alcoholic beverage (*Kunun-zaki*) sold in Keffi Metropolis, Nigeria. *Greener J Microbiol Antimicrobials* 2(2): 021-025.
10. HPA [Health Protection Agency] (2009). Guidelines for assessing microbiological safety of ready-to-eat foods. Available from: www.gov.uk/government/publication/ready-to-eat-foods-microbiological-safety-assessment-guideline (accessed 15 Jan 2015).
11. Idowu OA (2006). Oral faecal parasites and personal hygiene of food handlers in Abeokuta, Nigeria. *Afr Health Sci* 6:160-164.
12. ICMSF [International Commission on Microbiological Specifications for Foods] (1996). Microorganisms in foods 5: Microbiological specifications of pathogens. Blackie Academic and Professional Publishers London.
13. ICMSF [International Commission on Microbiological Specifications for Foods] (1998). Microorganism in foods 7: Microbiological testing in food safety management. New York: Academy Publishers, pp. 70 - 80.
14. Isong NB, Akpan MM, Udota HI and Barber L (2013). Antibacterial and microbial assessment of breads in Abak Local Government Area, Nigeria. *W Afr J Microbiol Biotech Res* 3(3):155-159.
15. Little CL, Monsey HA, Nichols GL and De-Louvois J (1998). The microbiological quality of ready-to-eat dried and fermented meat and meat products. *Int'l J Environ Health Res* 8: 277-284.
16. Mensah P, Yeboah-Manu D, Owusu-Darko K and Ablordey A (2002). Street foods in Accra, Ghana: How safe are they? *WHO Bull* 80(7): 546-554.
17. Nichols SL, Little CL, Mithani V and De-Louvois, J. (1999). The microbiological quality of cooked rice from restaurants and take-away premises in the United Kingdom. *J Food Prot* 62: 877-882.
18. Nwabueze RN and Archibald AR (1997). Effect of growth condition on secretion of protein by *Staphylococcus aureus*. *Niger J Microbiol* 11: 104-107.
19. Ogundare AO and Adetuyi FC (2003). Studies on the microbial population of bread baked with wheat flour from south western Nigeria. *Food, Agric Environ* 1(3&4): 85-87.
20. Olusegun TA, Olufemi OA, Olaniran O, Olusola A, Bolade KO and Oluwatoyosi O (2015). Safety of bread for human consumption in an urban community in Southwestern Nigeria. *Afr J Food Sci* 9(5):272-277.
21. Oranusi SU, Oguoma OI and Agusi E (2013). Microbiological quality assessment of foods sold in student's cafeteria. *Global Res J Microbiol* 3(1): 1-7.

22. Seiler D (1988). Microbiological problems associated with cereal based foods. *J Food Sci Technol* 2(1): 37-41.
23. Tambekar DH, Shirsat SD, Suradkar SB, Rajankar PN and Banginwar YS (2007). Prevention of transmission of infectious disease: Studies on hand hygiene in health-care among students. *Cont J Biomed Sci* 1: 6-10.
24. Taulo S, Wetlesen A, Abrahamsen R, Mkakosya R and Kululanga G (2008). Microbiological quality of water, associated management practices and risks at source, transport and storage points in a rural community of Lungwena, Malawi. *Afr J Microbiol Res* 7(2): 131-137.
25. Todd ECD, Greig JD, Bartleson CA and Micheals BS (2007a). Outbreaks where food workers have been implicated in the spread of foodborne disease. Part 2- Description of outbreaks by size, severity, and settings. *J Food Prot* 70(8): 1975-1993.
26. Todd ECD, Greig JD, Bartleson CA and Micheals BS (2007b). Outbreaks where food workers have been implicated in the spread of foodborne disease. Part 3- Factors contributing to the outbreaks and description of outbreak categories. *J Food Prot* 70(9): 2199-2217.
27. Unachukwu MN and Nwakanma C (2015). The fungi associated with the spoilage of bread in Enugu state. *Int'l J Curr Microbiol Appl Sci* 4(1): 989-995
28. Uzeh RE, Ohenhen RE and Ralugbokan AK (2006). Microbiological and nutritional qualities of dairy products: Nono and nutritional qualities of dairy products: Nono and awara. *Nat Sci* 4(3): 37-40.
29. Wagner AB (2009). Epidemiology of food poisoning outbreaks in Singapore, 2001-2005. *Epidemiol News Bull* 31: 68-72.
30. Weiser HH, Muntney CJ and Gold WA (1971). Practical food microbiology and technology. 2nd ed, West Port, Connecticut, AVI Publishing Company, 215, p72.
31. WHO (1989). Programme for control of diarrhoeal diseases. Manual for laboratory investigations of acute enteric infections.

Article's citation

Abubakar AI, Ishaq SA, Rabi HD, Nafiu SN, Abdulaziz UA, Haruna M (2017). Assessment of bacteriological quality of bread sold in Kano, Nigeria. *Ew J Epidemiol & Clin Med* 4(1): 55-59.

Author's Contributions:

Author AAI, and RHD designed the study, AAI AND NSA wrote the procedure and interpreted the data. Author AAI, ISA and anchored the experiments. Authors AAI and AUA managed the literature search and produced the initial draft. Authors AAI, ISA and HM reviewed the write up and effect corrections. Authors RHD, AUA and HM managed the financial activities. All authors approved final manuscript.